

Reproductive Health Ethics

National Autonomous University of Mexico

Instructor: Frances Kissling

11 sessions

October 22 to November 29, 2018

Mondays and Thursdays, 11-2:00 pm

Invited instructors:

Peter Singer, Princeton University (via Skype on personhood)

Ruth Macklin, retired, Albert Einstein Medical Center (on Surrogacy)

Rebecca Cook, University of Toronto (on Conscience)

John Townsend, Vice President, Reproductive Health at The Population Council (on Research Ethics).

Leonel Briozo, MD, Uruguay (on Harm Reduction in Reproductive Health)

Course Overview

Whether dealing with personal decisions or public policy, reproductive health matters are almost always controversial and often intractable. This course will explore the ethical dimensions of reproductive health controversies including 1) the moral and legal status of the human embryo and fetus in the context of assisted reproduction, embryonic stem cell research and abortion; 2) contraception, including over-the-counter provision of emergency contraception and the legislation challenges to contraceptive insurance coverage in the Affordable Care Act; 3) ethical issues raised by the reproductive technologies such as IVF, gamete donation, pre-implantation genetic diagnosis, and surrogacy as well as how these practices affect our perceptions of pregnancy, children, and family relationships; and 4) global concerns such as sex selective abortion; forced abortion and sterilization and reproductive rights in relation to population dynamics and environmental concerns.

11 class meetings of 3 hours each. Meetings with Professor Kissling can be arranged by emailing me at fkissling@gmail.com

Course Sessions and Readings

Readings will be posted on Dropbox. About 20 – 25 pages of reading will be required for each class.

Assignments:

Two “argument” papers, which are short, 3-5 page papers on a chosen text or topic.

Final Paper: 10-12 page paper; topic pre-cleared with instructor.

Final Grade: Argument papers (2): 20% each; final paper 40%; class participation 20%.

Class Schedule

1.- Introduction to the course

Your expectations and interest, review syllabus, my expectations

2. Moral Status of the fetus – personhood – guest lecturer Peter Singer by skype

Readings

Peter Singer, "Taking Life: The Embryo and the Fetus" Practical Ethics, Cambridge University Press

Peter Singer "What's Wrong with Killing?" Practical Ethics, Cambridge University Press

Patrick Lee and Robert George. "The Wrong of Abortion" Contemporary Issues in Applied Ethics, ed, Andrew I Cohen and Christopher Heath Wellman, Blackwell Press <http://www.public.iastate.edu/~jwcwolf/Papers/LeeGeorge.pdf>

2. Moral Status of the Extra-Corporeal Embryo; Stem Cell Research

Readings

Michael Sandel, "The Logic of Human Stem Cell Research," NEJM 2004.

Patrick McCugh, "Zygote and 'Clonote'—The Ethical Use of Embryonic Stem Cells," NEJM 2004.

Robert George and Patrick Lee, "Acorns and Embryos," The New Atlantis 2005.

Lawrence J. Nelson, Michael J. Meyer, "Confronting Deep Disagreement: The President's Council on Bioethics, Moral Status, and Human Embryos" AJOB 2005.

3. Feminist ethics and abortion

Readings

Margaret O. Little, "The Morality of Abortion," from A Companion to Applied Ethics, 2003.

Margaret O. Little, "Abortion, Intimacy and the Duty to Gestate"

https://www.jstor.org/stable/27504096?seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents

Gustavo Ortiz-Millan, "Etica feminista, etica femenina, y aborto", Debate Feminista

Celia Wolf-Devine and Philip Devine, "The Prima Facie Case Against Abortion,"

Abortion Three Perspectives ed. Michael Tooley, Oxford University Press 2009 pp.76-91

Frances Kissling, "Is There Life Beyond Roe? How to Think About the Fetus" (2004-05)

4. Ethics of Genetic Testing, PGD Disability Rights and Sex Selective Abortion Guest

Speaker Barbara Katz Rothman, CUNY

Readings

Barbara Katz Rothman, "Prenatal Diagnosis" (1991), from Arras, ed., Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine, 1998.

Bonnie Steinbock, "Disability, Prenatal Testing, and Selective Abortion" (2000), Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine (2008)

Adrienne Asch, "Prenatal Diagnosis and Selective Abortion: A Challenge to Practice and Policy" (1999), from Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine (2008).

Nick Bostrom and Julian Savulescu, 'Human Enhancement Ethics: The State of the Debate' <http://www.nickbostrom.com/ethics/human-enhancement-ethics.pdf>
Supplementary reading, Harriet McBryde Johnson, "An Unspeakable Conversation," NYT Magazine.

5. Reproductive Health and Research Ethics

Guest Lecturer John Townsend, Vice President The Population Council

Readings

Françoise Baylis, Pregnant Women Deserve Better. *Nature* 465, 689–690 (10 June 2010).

Macklin, Ruth, *Beyond Regulations: Ethics in human subjects research* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1999), 23-44.

Macklin, Ruth, Informed Consent for Research: International Perspectives, *Journal of the American Medical Women's Association*, Vol. 55, No. 5 (2000), 290-293.

6. Application of the principle of Do No Harm to Illegal Reproductive Health Services

Reading

Joanna Erdman, "Harm Reduction, Human Rights and Access to Information on Safer Abortion," *International Journal of Gynecology and Obstetrics*, 118, 2012

Alyson Hyman, et.al. Misoprostol in women's hands, a harm reduction strategy for unsafe abortion" *Contraception* 87,2013, Elsevier

7- Population Policies and Reproductive Health: forced sterilization, rape as an instrument of war, China's One Child Policy*

Readings to be announced

8 – Ethics and the Human Rights Frame for Reproductive Health

Readings

International Human Rights Law and the Right to Health; Forman and Bomze in the Right to Health Theory and Practice

Cook, Rebecca "Applying human rights to improve access to reproductive health services," 119 (2012) *International Journal of Gynecology and Obstetrics* S55–S59.

9. Conscience and the Right to Refuse to provide services.

ACOG Committee on Ethics, "The Limits of Conscientious Refusal in Reproductive Medicine," Nov. 2007.

Bernard Dickens, Conscientious Commitment, *The Lancet*, 12 April 2008,

<http://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736%2808%2960547-4/fulltext>

Cabal, Luisa, Striking a Balance: Conscientious Objection and Reproductive Health Care in Colombia

<https://www.hhrjournal.org/2014/09/striking-a-balance-conscientious-objection-and-reproductive-health-care-from-the-colombian-perspective/>

Gustavo Ortiz Millan, "Abortion and Conscientious Objection: Rethinking Conflicting

rights in the Mexican Context” Global Bioethics 2017.

10. Women’s rights during pregnancy: forced Caesarians, obstetrical violence, drug and alcohol dependent women.

Lynn Paltrow and Jeanne Flavin, “Arrests of and Forced Interventions on Pregnant Women In the US, 1973-2005: Implications for Women’s Legal Status and Public Health”, Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law, 2013

<http://jhppl.dukejournals.org/content/early/2013/01/15/03616878-1966324.full.pdf+html>

Cook, Rebecca, The Injustice of Unsafe Motherhood, *Developing World Bioethics* 2 (1): 64-81 (2002).

11. Infertility: Is there a right to a child? Assisted Reproduction and Surrogacy

Readings

Katz Rothman, Barbara, *Recreating Motherhood*, Introduction

Surrogate Motherhood in India

<https://web.stanford.edu/group/womenscourage/Surrogacy/moraethical.html>

Santos, Yaiza, The Real Story of Mexico’s Surrogate Mothers

https://elpais.com/elpais/2017/01/02/inenglish/1483355190_156732.html

12. Religious perspectives on reproductive health and rights

Readings

Heather Boonstra, Islam, Women and Family Planning: A Primer, Guttmacher Institute <http://www.guttmacher.org/pubs/tgr/04/6/gr040604.pdf>

Susan Teft Nicholson, Abortion and The Catholic Church, *JRE Studies in Religious Ethics*, 1978 pp 1-18

13. The Ethics of Fetal Tissue Research: What Obligation Is Owed to the Fetus and to the Pregnant Woman

Readings

National Commission Report of Research on Fetal Subjects. Read section on Ethics and Conclusions

Chromeextension://oemmndcblldboiebfnladdacbfmadadm/https://ia800209.us.archive.org/34/items/researchonfetusr00unit/researchonfetusr00unit.pdf